# NATIONAL CAPITAL TERRITORY OF DELHI

## **EVALUATION STUDY REPORT**

## ON

## HOLIDAY HOMES FOR INDUSTRIAL WORKERS

**JUNE -2001** 

EVALUATION UNIT
PLANNING DEPARTMENT
GOVERNMENTOF N.C.T. OF DELHI
2<sup>ND</sup> FLOOR ISBT BUILDING
KASHMERE GATE
DELHI – 6

## **Evaluation Study Report on Holiday Homes for Industrial Workers**

## **Contents**

SN	CHAPTER	PAGE NUMBER
		_
1.	Introduction	4
2.	The Evaluation Study –	5
	Reason, Objectives & Methodology	
3.	Budget Allocation & Expenditure	6
4.	Agreements for Renting of Holiday Homes	9
5.	Findings	11
6.	Running of Holiday Homes on Private Management	14
	Contract Basis	
7.	Comparative Study of Holiday Homes of other	15
	Organisations	
8.	Views of the Managers of Holiday Homes of Labour	16
	Department.	
9.	Views of Visitors	17
10.	Conclusions and Recommendations	18

## OFFICERS AND STAFF ASSOCIATED WITH THE STUDY

SN	Name of the Officers/Officials	Designation
1.	Shri A.K.Gopinathan	<b>Joint Director</b>
2.	Shri J.K.Baswala	Deputy Director
3.	Shri B.S.Bahl	Asstt. Director
4.	Shri R.C.Kesarwani	Research Officer
5.	Shri Ashok Kumar	Stat. Asstt.
6.	Shri Naresh Chander	Stat. Asstt.
7.	Shri Narain Das	Stat. Asstt.
8.	Shri J.K.Arora	Stat. Asstt.
9.	Shri Raj Kumar	Stat.
		Investigator
10.	Shri Sanir kumar	Steno
11.	Shri Mukesh Kumar	L.D.C.
12.	Shri Naresh Kumar Gupta	L.D.C.

#### **Evaluation study of Holiday Homes for Industrial workers**

#### Chapter - 1

#### Introduction

- 1.1 The Labour Deptt. has a Plan Scheme "Setting up of Holiday Homes for Industrial Workers". This scheme was initiated as a part of welfare scheme for industrial workers during 1970. Under this scheme Holiday Homes at various places of tourist interest are to be opened so that industrial workers and their families can stay in these Holiday Homes during visit to these places at nominal rent.
- 1.2 Employees of Govt. of NCT of Delhi have also been allowed to stay in these Holiday Homes but rates fixed for these employees are higher than those of industrial workers. The tariff rates of these Holiday Homes have been revised w.e.f. 1.4.2000. The old and new rates per day for a room in these Holiday Homes are given below:-

Category	Old Rate	New Rate (w.e.f. 1.4.2000)
(i) Industrial Worker	Rs. 5/-	Rs. 25/-
(ii) Employees of	Rs. 15/-	Rs. 150/-
G.N.C.T.D. or of its		
autonomous bodies		

Under this scheme two Holiday Homes are functioning in rented premises one at Haridwar and the other at Mussorrie. In March 1998, 8 flats were purchased at Shimla from Himachal Pradesh Vikas Pradhikaran at a cost of Rs. 57 Lakh and in March 2000, two flats were purchased at Allahabad from Allahabad Development Authority at a cost of Rs. 21 Lakh for setting up Holiday Homes at these places.

The Evaluation Study – Reason, Objectives and Methodology

- 2.1 In March 1998, after paying full amount of Rs. 57 Lakh, possession of 8 flats at Shimla was taken. In March 2000, possession of 2 flats at Allahabad was taken. Furniture etc for Allahabad Home was purchased and this Holiday Home would be made functional as soon as the electricity connection is obtained from the State Electricity Board. Steps were taken to furnish the Holiday Home at Shimla but officers of Labour Deptt. who visited Shimla reported that the flats are not centrally located. However, the officials who had initially visited and identified the site at the time of purchase, reported that the location was the best possible available location.
- 2.2 The Hon'ble Minister of Labour desired that steps be initiated for furnishing of the flats expeditiously so that Holiday Home could be put to use.
- 2.3 Since the flats at Shimla have been lying vacant since 1998, Chief Secretary directed that a quick evaluation study of the Scheme be done before furnishing the Holiday Homes at Shimla.

#### 2.4 Methodology

For conducting evaluation study of the scheme, it was decided to visit Holiday Homes at Haridwar & Mussoorie. For this purpose a questionnaire was prepared, to collect information from the in-charge of the Holiday Homes, the visitors and for general information regarding Holiday Homes. A team of officers of Evaluation Unit of Planning Deptt visited these Holiday Homes from  $6^{th}$  November 2000 to  $10^{th}$  November 2000, staying 2 days at each Holiday Homes.

## **Budget Allocation and Expenditure**

#### 3.1 Under Plan Head

(Rs.in Lakh)

Duration	Approved Outlay	Expenditure	
8 <sup>th</sup> Plan(1992-97	12.00	10.56 *	
1997-98	13.00	55.98 *	
1998-99	40.00	10.00 *	
1999-2000	40.00	4.12 **	
2000-2001	2.50		

Note:- \* The Expenditure incurred for the purchase of Flats of Holiday Homes at Shimla & Allahabad.

\*\* Out of this, an expenditure of Rs. 87,950/- incurred for purchase of Fabric items for Holiday Homes at Haridwar & Mussoorie. The remaining amount pertains to Holiday Homes at Shimla & Allahabad.

#### 3.2 Under Non-Plan Head

#### **Mussoorie**

(In Rs)

SN	Time Period	Budget Allocation	Total Expend.	Expenditure on				
				Salary	Rent	Electricity & Tele-phone	Repair & Maintain	Other items
1.	8 <sup>th</sup> Five year plan	2043000	1184104	329084	361371	43714	63963	385972
2.	1997-98	456000	273147	120657	57996	35740	3600	55154
3.	1998-99	599000	318513	130781	-	25386	2270	160076
4.	1999-2000	779000	441212	144431	-	8767	1877	286137
5.	2000-01 Up to 30.11.2000	710000	136592	121816	-	12663	2113	-

#### **Haridwar**

(In Rs.)

SN	Time Period	Budget	Total		Expenditure on			
		Allocation *	Expend.					
				Salary	Rent	Electricity&	Repair &	Other
						Telephone	Maintain <u>.</u>	items
1.	8 <sup>th</sup> Five	2043000	858261	323327	165696	37208	48487	283543
	year plan							
2.	1997-98	456000	182723	117295	27912	2031	-	35485
3.	1998-99	599000	280358	127989	-	7273	-	145096
4.	1999-2000	779000	337580	145426	-	5595	-	186559
5.	2000-01 Up	710000	117546	110168	=	4793	-	2585
	to 30.11.2000							

#### • Combined allocation for both the Holiday Homes

It is seen from above statement of expenditure supplied by Labour Deptt. that in addition to salary, rent, telephone, water and electricity bills a lot of expenditure was spent every year during 8<sup>th</sup> Plan and current Five Year Plan under Non-Plan for other items both on Haridwar & Mussoorie Holiday Homes. For example during 8<sup>th</sup> Plan the expenditure on other items for Mussoorie & Haridwar was Rs. 3.86 Lakh.and 2.84 Lakh respectively. Expenditure on Mussoorie Holiday Homes during 1997-98, 1998-99 and 1999-2000 under other items was Rs.55154, 160076 and 286137 respectively whereas on Haridwar the expenditure during these years was Rs. 35485, Rs. 145096 and Rs. 186559 respectively. The items on which this expenditure was incurred were not indicated.

#### 3.3 Income/Earning from Bookings

(in Rupees)

Holiday Homes	Category of visitors	1997-98	1998-99	1999-2000	2000-01(up
					to 31.10.2000
	Industrial Workers etc.	425	130	335	1300
A. Haridwar	Delhi Govt. employee	2745	950	1170	3930
A. nanuwar					
	Total	3170	1080	1505	5230
	Industrial Workers etc.	525	640	650	3525
D 14					
B. Mussoorie	Delhi Govt. employee	4500	4100	2010	15590
	Total	5025	4740	2660	19115
Total Income (A-	8195	5820	4165	24345	

The above table indicates that income from employees of Govt. of Delhi is more as compared to industrial workers which is due to two reasons :

- (i) Tariff for employees of Govt. of Delhi is more as compared to industrial workers and
- (ii) Number of Govt. employees visiting Holiday Homes are more than Industrial workers. It is seen that the earnings from bookings during the part of year 2000-01 (up to 31.10.2000) is more than the whole of previous years. This is because the rates have been increased substantially w.e.f. April 2000.

From the above table it is observed that the expenditure on operation of these two Holiday Homes is far in excess of the income earned.

Agreements for Renting of Holiday Homes.

#### 4.1 Haridwar

During the visit of evaluation team it was found that the existing rent of the building is Rs. 2256/- per month. But the Labour Deptt. supplied an agreement which has been signed between Labour Deptt. and owner of the Holiday Homes on 22.06.84 in which the rent is given as Rs. 14,400/- per annum. The owner of the building informed the evaluation team that though the Labour Deptt. has enhanced the rent as Rs. 3355/- per month from 1995 but he is not accepting this rent at present because he wants to enhance it further.

It was noticed by the evaluation team that the building was in a very bad condition and required immediate renovation, white washing and repairs which have not been done for the last many years. The owner was prepared to renovate the building provided rent is enhanced suitably and all arrears of the rent is paid to him.

#### 4.2 Mussoorie

The labour Deptt. has supplied a very old agreement which was signed on 23.03.88. between the Labour Deptt. and owner of the building. In this agreement rent was enhanced from Rs.9500/- per annum to Rs.21888/- per annum w.e. from 1.9.82 and in consideration of the aforesaid enhancement and in consideration of the aforesaid arrears which may be accrued as a result of the enhancement, the proprietor shall carry out all necessary repairs and spend the entire amount of arrears on maintenance and repairs etc of the said premises to the entire satisfaction of the Government. As per agreement following additions/alterations and repairs were to be carried out by the proprietor.

- (1) Mirrors (size 2' X 1-6") to be provided in 16 rooms.
- (2) All the four WCs in the existing bath rooms shall be replaced by new Indian WCs. Four new WCs pans will be provided in the bath rooms so as to give two WCs to each suite. Out of four WCs one English type WC will be provided in one of the toilet.
- (3) Four sinks will be provided in four kitchens. Three sinks will be in mosaic chips and one sink will be of white glazed.
- (4) Pelmets will be provided for all the doors windows.
- (5) Steel collapsible gate will be provided at the entrance so as to make it more safe.
- (6) New doors 2 Nos. will be provided in two suites opening in the gallery.
- (7) Middle wall of suite No. 5 and 6 will be removed to make it a hall.
- (8) Glazed tiles will be provided in the bathrooms and toilets where English type WC is to be fixed.
- (9) The roof in some of the rooms were leaking very badly. The defective wooden parts of the trusses will be replaced/repaired and the roof completely repaired in such way so as to make the whole building completely leak proof. The roof will be painted on the top.

- (10) All the doors and windows and other wood work will be painted.
- (11) Distemper will be done in one of the suits and the white wash and colour wash will be done in the remaining building.
- (12) All the broken glasses will be replaced.
- (13) All other repairs in the building wherever necessary will be carried out to make it livable and descent looking.

However, during the visit of the Evaluation Team, the manager informed that the present rent of the building is Rs. 4833/- per month and no repair work/addition/alterations have been under taken in the building for the last many years.

The latest agreements for both the Homes have not been supplied by the Labour Deptt. However as per this agreement the cost of the maintenance is to be borne by the owner but it is observed that no expenditure is incurred on the maintenance of the building as the building is in dilapidated condition.

#### **Findings**

5.1 Capacity, Condition & Location of Holiday Homes

#### Haridwar

The Holiday Homes at Haridwar is situated in the heart of the city and is less than half a k.m. from Har-Ki-Pauri. Almost all the important visiting places are situated around half to five K.M from the Holiday Homes. Enough restaurants/hotels and shopping centers are available near by. Every type of mode of conveyance is also available from Rly. station and Bus-station within a k.m. distance.

The building has been taken on rent and the monthly rent is Rs. 3355/-. The Holiday Homes came in existence in the year 1976. It is a part of a three-storied building. At ground floor there are three shops and the Holiday Homes is situated in upper two floors.

The Holiday Homes has 6 double bed rooms for visitors, one room for manager, one common room and three small rooms, which are being utilized as store rooms (2) and office (1). In addition, two latrines and two bathrooms are available at each floor. The entrance of the Holiday Homes is from backside of the building. Though location wise and capacity wise, the Holiday Homes is undoubtedly very good but maintenance of building is poor.

Whitewash and repairs etc. have not been done in the Holiday Homes for the last 7-8 years. During interview with the owner of the building, it has come to the knowledge that he has not been accepting rent from the Deptt. for the last three years and has requested the Deptt. to increase the rent w.e.f. 1995. Therefore, no white wash/repairs have been done in the Holiday Homes. The owner wants the rent to be increased from RS.2256/-p.m. to Rs.3355/- p.m. w.e.f. 1995 and further to Rs. 6000/-p.m. from 1997.

#### Mussoorie

The Holiday Homes at Mussoorie is also functioning from rented premises in 900 sq feet area. The monthly rent is Rs. 4833/- P.M. The Holiday Homes was started in the year 1975. The Holiday Homes is adjacent to "Library Bus Stand" and has a good natural view. There are 12 double bed rooms out of which two rooms have attached latrine-bathroom, one dormitory consisting of five beds, four other rooms for office, store, accommodation for manager and kitchen. In addition 7 latrines and 7 bathrooms, one common/drawing- room are also available.

The condition of the building is very miserable. The roof, electric wiring, doors, and windows are all in dilapidated condition. The roof leaks during rainy days. Windows have been fully destroyed by termites and all the window panes are broken. The road

connecting the Holiday Homes is also in poor condition. Repair/ whitewash have not been done for the last many years.

Location wise it is ideally located as most of visiting places are available around half to five K.M. range. Enough restaurants and shopping centers are available near by the Holiday Homes.

#### 5.2 Maintenance of Furniture, Beds etc.

At both the places it is found that furniture, mattresses, beds, bed-sheet, pillows etc are in very poor condition. Mattresses and pillows, bed sheets, curtains and pillow covers are very old and require replacement urgently. There is no proper arrangement for washing of bed-sheets/pillow covers/curtains etc. The beds are of small size measuring 6'x 4'.

The managers of both the Holiday Homes have requested the Labour Deptt. many a time to provide these items, but no action has been taken so far by the Labour Deptt. of Govt. of .Delhi.

#### 5.3 Staff Available

For management of these Holiday Homes, two regular employees and one part time sweeper have been posted at each Homes . The details of staff is in the following table :

Sr.	Designation	Pay-scale(in Rs.)	Haridwar		Mussoorie	
No			Sanctioned	In position	Sanctioned	In position
1	2	3	4	5	6	7
1	Manager	4000-6000	1	1	1	1
2	Peon/chowkidar	2550-3200	1	1	1	1
3	Part time sweeper	(i) Lum-sum amount of Rs.591 at Haridwar (ii) Lum-sum amount of Rs.788 at Mussoorie	1	1	1	1

#### 5.4 Facilities available at Holiday Homes

#### (i) Boarding

Though Boarding is not available at both the Homes, enough utensils and kerosene stoves are available to use these for preparing meals etc.

#### (ii) Recreational Facilities

In Haridwar one T.V is available in the common room and one in the VIP room, but in Mussoorie this facility is not available. At Haridwar different magazines like Sarita, Grih-shobha, Hindustan Times (News Paper) etc are available but at Mussoorie neither news papers nor any magazine is available. Only a few old books and novels etc. are available here.

#### 5.5 Flow of visitors

The following table indicates the number of booking as obtained from the Registers kept at both the Holiday Homes.

No of Bookin	gs			(In Number)	
Holiday	Category of visitors	1997-98	1998-99	1999-2000	2000-01 (up
Homes					to
					31.10.2000)
	Ind. Workers etc.	24	14	20	30
	Delhi Govt.	68	41	29	13
A. Haridwar	employees and its				
A. Halluwai	autonomous bodies				
	Total	92	55	49	43
	Ind. Workers etc.	29	34	27	36
	Delhi Govt.	74	53	39	40
B. Mussoorie	employees and its				
B. Wassoone	autonomous bodies				
	Total	103	87	66	76
Grand Total (A	.+B)	195	142	115	119
					1

It is seen from the table that number of industrial workers visiting Holiday-Homes is less than Govt. employees. This may be due to lack of awareness among industrial workers regarding this scheme. Only 214 bookings (88 for Haridwar and 126 for Mussoorie) were made for industrial workers during April 97 to Oct. 2000 i.e. 3 years and 7months period/as against 357 bookings (151 for Haridwar and 206 for Mussoorie) were made during this period for employees of Govt. of Delhi and its autonomous bodies. The table also reveals that number of bookings for Mussooie are more than that of Haridwar.

Thus the study team observed that the occupancy rate in both the Holiday Homes almost throughout the year is poor mainly due to very bad condition of the Holiday Homes.

#### Chapter – 6

#### Running of Holiday Homes on Private Management Contract Basis

- 6.1 In order to explore the possibility of running these Homes on private management contract basis, the study team contacted some owners of the Hotels in these cities.
- 6.2 As the condition of both the Holiday Homes is very poor so the first condition put forward by the owners was that they can think of running the Holiday Homes only when these are renovated and fully furnished.
- 6.3 In Haridwar the team contacted many hotel owners but all refused to run the Holiday Homes on contract basis. One manager in a Dharmshala, however, was interested in running the Holiday Homes on contract basis on a annual contract of Rs. 1.00 Lakh. The rate is only for supervision. All maintenance and bills like electricity, telephone and water etc would be borne by the Deptt. of Labour.
- 6.4 In Mussoorie one owner of the hotel was interested in running the Holiday Homes on the annual contract of Rs. 1.50 Lakh. Here also rent of the building, general maintenance of the building and furniture, washing of bed-sheets, curtains etc, replacement of furniture as and when required repairs/white-washing of the building and payment of water/electricity/telephone bills etc would be borne by the Deptt.

#### Chapter – 7

### Comparative Study of Holiday Homes of other Organisations

#### 7.1 Holiday Homes for Industrial Workers of Haryana State at Haridwar

Labour Deptt of Haryana Govt is running this Holiday Homes. This Holiday-Homes consists of five bedrooms and is situated at Ambala House, Niranjan Akhara Road Haridwar. The State Govt have taken this building on rent of Rs. 6000/- P.M. Like the Labour Deptt of Delhi Govt. the manager, a peon-cum chowkidar and sweeper look after the Holiday-Homes. The Manager and the peon are the employees of the Labour Deptt of Haryana. The flow of visitors is very good in the Holiday Homes. Here, stay for the industrial workers of the Haryana state alongwith their family is free. Moreover, Labour Deptt. of Haryana State pays to and fro fare to the workers and their family when they stay on this Holiday-Homes.

#### 7.2 Holiday Homes of Delhi Jal Board at Mussoorie

This Holiday Homes of Delhi Jal Board is functioning in their own building. It is situated at Spring Road, Mussoorie and consists of 5 rooms - three double rooms and two single rooms. Each room has attached kitchen, bath and toilet. All rooms are fully furnished and have coloured TV and sofa-set etc. The charge of single room are Rs. 25/per day and for double room Rs.50/- per day. The Holiday Homes is running very well. Only employees of Delhi Jal Board are entitled to stay in the Holiday Homes. Supervision of the Holiday Homes is done by care-taker who is employee of the Delhi Jal Board in the grade of Rs. 4000-6000/-per month + Rs. 700/- p.m as special pay and two Master Roll workers getting consolidated pay of R.s. 2500/- p.m each.

Delhi Jal Board does general maintenance and payment of bills etc. The Master Roll employees do washing of bed-sheets, pillow covers and curtains etc and the caretaker has imprest money of Rs. 4000/-. He is allowed to purchase small items like bulbs tube lights, soaps and can pay electricity and water bills etc.

#### 7.3 Holiday Homes of Reserve Bank of India in Mussoorie

Like the Holiday Homes of Delhi Jal Board, this Holiday Homes, which is for the employees of R.B.I., is also in a very good condition and is running very well. This Holiday Homes consists of 6 rooms-all attached with bath and toilet. All rooms are fully furnished with coloured TV & Sofa etc. Room rent for officers is Rs. 25/- per day and for lower staff, Rs. 15/- per day.

This Holiday Homes is on contract basis @ Rs. 15000/- per month. All maintenance, washing of bed-sheets, curtains etc and payment of bills are made by R.B.I.

Views of the Managers of Holiday Homes of Labour Deptt.

- 8.1 Managers of both the Holiday-Homes were of the view that these Holiday-Homes are situated at very good locations and have sufficient accommodations. These can attract visitors provided these are maintained properly. They informed that the furniture and other items like, mattresses, pillows and curtains etc in the Holiday-Homes are very old and have not been replaced for the last many years. They have requested the Labour Deptt. in this respect many a time but no action has been taken. They have requested the owner for repair/white-washing of the building but because of dispute regarding the rent etc, no action has been taken in this direction also.
- 8.2 The managers were of the view that their present imprest money of Rs. 250/- only, should be increased suitably and they should be permitted to purchase small items like bulbs, tube-light and also be allowed to make payment of electricity water and telephone bills etc.
- 8.3 The Managers also desired that the procedure for booking of the visitors should be improved. In addition to the booking at the Headquarters the booking should also be done at some prominent places where there is cluster of industrial workers. They also desired that proper advertisement of the scheme should be made and hoarding should be placed at prominent places in Delhi particularly in industrial cluster areas.
- 8.4 The Managers of the Holiday Homes told that they have brought to the notice the views of the visitors, to the Labour Department and have requested the department to take appropriate action, so that the flow of the visitors increases but so far no action has been taken.

Views of the visitors staying in the Holiday Homes.

During the visit of the study team, there was no visitor staying in either of the Holiday Homes. In order to have the views of the visitors, the study team have to depend on the comments written by the visitors in the "Register for comments of the visitors" placed in the Holiday Homes. From the comments of the visitors, it was observed that:-

- (i) Almost all visitors were satisfied with the behavior of the staff of both the Holiday Homes.
- (ii) Visitors were having common complaint regarding poor maintenance of the Holiday Homes.
- (iii) Visitors were not happy with the furniture, particularly beds, bed-sheets, mattresses, pillows and curtains etc.
- (iv) The visitors at Mussoorie desired that electric wiring should be replaced, walls, windows and roofs that leak during rainy season should be replaced/renovated.
- (v) The visitors at Mussoorie have complained regarding the shortage of water and non- availability of blankets.
- (vi) The visitors wanted geysers, TV's and some indoor games in the Holiday Homes.
- (vii) It was also desired that some magazines and newspapers should be provided in the Holiday Homes in Mussoorie.
- (viii) Visitors desired that increased tariff rates were very high and should be reduced.
- (ix) Some visitors were also of the view that there should be provision of generator in the Holiday Homes.
- (x) Visitors in Haridwar found that fans/coolers were not in working order. As the imprest money with the manager was small, so they desired that it should be increased, so that he could repair these minor items.
- (xi) They observed that bed in the Holiday Homes were small and very old. They desired that those be replaced with suitable ones.

#### Chapter – 10

#### Conclusions and Recommendations

It is observed that the Labour Department is not in a position to manage these Holiday Homes which have been functioning for 20-25 years. Both buildings at Haridwar and Mussoorie are rented and are in a very bad condition. Repair and whitewashing have not been done for several years, roofs are leaking and windowpanes have broken. Furniture, mattresses, bed sheets and pillows are in very poor condition. There are no proper arrangements for washing of linen.

- 10.1 The department incurred an expenditure of Rs. 4,41,212/- on Holiday Homes at Mussoorie in 1999-2000 under non-plan against which it earned an income of Rs. 2,660/- only. During the same period, expenditure at Haridwar was Rs. 3,37,580/- and income earned was Rs. 1, 505/-. Despite considerable expenditure having been incurred, there was no visible impact in terms of better maintenance or better facilities.
- 10.2 Against the capacity of 540 booking per annum, the average booking per annum at Haridwar Homes was only 65 during 1997-98, 1998-99 and 1999-2000 i.e. capacity utilisation of 12% only. Similarly, the capacity utilisation at Mussoorie Holiday Homes was about 8% per annum.
- 10.3 As no social objective is being achieved, given the negligible number of industrial workers visiting these holiday Homes, it is, therefore, suggested that the two Holiday Homes at Haridwar and Mussoorie should be closed forthwith and the scheme wound up. The property purchased at Shimla and Allahabad for setting up new Holiday Homes should also be disposed off without incurring any further infructuous expenditure.